

## APPENDIX 1 to Tim Malim’s Proof of Evidence for Cultural Heritage

### Belvoir Solar Farm: heritage asset, setting and harm concordance table from submitted documents

Heritage Asset	Appellant’s position on contribution of setting	Level of harm
<b>As identified in Environmental Statement Appendix 3.1 Heritage Statement section 6.7</b>		
Grade I Listed Building – Belvoir Castle	<p>6.25 The setting of the castle also contributes to the significance of the asset, although the significance derived from the setting is less than that from its historic fabric. The principal elements of the physical surrounds and experience of the castle (its ‘setting’) which are considered to contribute to its heritage significance comprise:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The relationship between the individual heritage assets which as a group that form the complex of designated heritage assets at Belvoir;</li> <li>• The prominent position on an area of high ground overlooking the Vale of Belvoir;</li> <li>• Views towards the Castle which allow for an appreciation of its role as a strategically placed defensive stronghold, and later as a demonstration of wealth;</li> <li>• Views north-eastwards from the Castle over its park and estate land over the Vale of Belvoir;</li> <li>• Associative and functional relationships with some elements of the wider Belvoir Estate.</li> </ul>	6.50 Less than substantial and at the lowermost end of that spectrum.
Grade II* Registered Park and Garden at Belvoir Castle	<p>6.66 The setting of the Park and Garden also contributes to the significance of the asset, although the significance derived from the setting is less than that from its historic fabric. The principal elements of the physical surrounds and experience of the Park and Garden (its ‘setting’) which are considered to contribute to its heritage significance comprise:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The relationship between the individual heritage assets which as a group form the complex of designated heritage assets at Belvoir;</li> <li>• Some elements of the surrounding countryside such as where it provides any designed extension to any view from within the Park and Garden.</li> </ul>	6.95 Less than substantial harm and at the lowermost end of that spectrum

<p>Belvoir Castle Conservation Area</p>	<p>6.99 The setting of the Conservation Area also contributes to its significance, although the significance derived from the setting is less than that from its historic fabric. The principal elements of the physical surrounds and experience of the Conservation Area (its 'setting') which are considered to contribute to its heritage significance comprise:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The relationship between the individual heritage assets which as a group form the complex of designated heritage assets at Belvoir;</li> <li>• Some elements of the surrounding countryside such as where it provides a clearly-visible extension to some views from within the Conservation Area.</li> </ul>	<p>6.108 Less than substantial and at the lowermost end of the spectrum</p>
<p>Grade II* Listed Building – Church of St John the Baptist at Muston</p>	<p>6.138 The setting of the church also contributes to the significance of the asset, although the significance derived from the setting is less than that from its historic fabric. The principal elements of the physical surrounds and experience of the church (its 'setting') which are considered to contribute to its heritage significance comprise:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Its churchyard and associated headstones;</li> <li>• The Grade II Listed War Memorial;</li> <li>• The surrounding village settlement and fields to the south of the A52 and east of Easthorpe Road that affirm its rural character.</li> </ul>	<p>6.150 Less than substantial harm, and at the lowermost end of that spectrum.</p>
<p>Grade I Listed Building – Church of St Mary at Bottesford</p>	<p>6.118 The setting of the church also contributes to the significance of the asset, although the significance derived from the setting is less than that from its historic fabric. The principal elements of the physical surrounds and experience of the church (its 'setting') which are considered to contribute to its heritage significance comprise:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Its churchyard and associated headstones;</li> <li>• The Grade II Listed Parker Memorial and War Memorial and Table Tombs in the Graveyard;</li> <li>• The surrounding village settlement of Bottesford;</li> <li>• Surrounding roads and footpaths from where the church can be seen: and</li> <li>• Belvoir Castle due to its historical patronage and final resting place for several members of the family.</li> </ul>	<p>6.132 Less than substantial harm, and at the lowermost end of that spectrum,</p>
<p>Grade II Listed Building – Peacock Farmhouse</p>	<p>6.156 The setting of the farmhouse also contributes to the significance of the asset, although the significance derived from the setting is less than that from its historic fabric. The principal elements of the physical surrounds and experience of the church (its 'setting') which are considered to contribute to its heritage significance comprise:</p>	<p>6.162 No harm to the significance of the farmhouse</p>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Its garden curtilage – from where the building can best be appreciated;</li> <li>• Its associated traditional farm buildings;</li> <li>• Some elements of the wider rural landscape, including the fields immediately adjacent to its garden which it has clear intervisibility with.</li> </ul>	
Scheduled Monument and Grade II* Listed Building – The Village Cross at Muston	<p>6.168 The setting of the cross also contributes to the significance of the asset, although the significance derived from the setting is less than that from its historic fabric. The principal elements of the physical surrounds and experience of the cross (its ‘setting’) which are considered to contribute to its heritage significance comprise:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The elevated grassed area immediately surrounding the cross.</li> <li>• The roadside from where it can be appreciated and accessed from.</li> <li>• The village which it served.</li> <li>• The open field opposite to the west.</li> </ul>	6.173 No harm to the significance of the cross
Scheduled Monument - Earthwork Remains of the Moated Grange Site at Muston	<p>6.181 The setting of the moated grange site also contributes to the significance of the asset, although the significance derived from the setting is less than that from its historic fabric. The principal elements of the physical surrounds and experience of the cross (its ‘setting’) which are considered to contribute to its heritage significance comprise:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The relationship of the moated complex with the wider settlement of Muston.</li> <li>• Some elements of the wider agricultural landscape, particularly fields between the site and Easthorpe Road.</li> <li>• Contemporary medieval structures and sites the wider landscape.</li> </ul>	6.194 No harm to the significance of the Scheduled Monument
Easthorpe Conservation Area	<p>6.200 The setting of the Conservation Area also contributes to the significance of the asset, although the significance derived from the setting is less than that from its historic fabric. The principal elements of the physical surrounds and experience of the cross (its ‘setting’) which are considered to contribute to its heritage significance comprise:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Some aspects of the surrounding agricultural landscape that define the extent of the area;</li> <li>• The village of Bottesford in which parish the hamlet is part of.</li> </ul>	6.205 No harm to the significance of the Conservation Area or any heritage assets within it.

Heritage Asset	Appellant's position on contribution of setting	Level of harm
As identified in Environmental Statement Cultural Heritage Table 3-6		
Belvoir Castle	<p>3.5.19 The Grade I Listing of the building highlights that it is a heritage asset of the highest significance as defined by the NPPF and is thereby a receptor of <b>high value</b>. The heritage significance of this Listed Building is principally embodied in its architectural and artistic interest through its architectural styles, materials and interiors and historic interest as a seat of aristocratic power since the Normal period. It is a physical record part of the nation's history and part of the local identity. The castle also has archaeological interest in its ability to potentially reveal further evidence about past human activity.</p> <p>3.5.20 The setting of the castle also contributes to the significance of the asset, although the significance derived from the setting is less than that from its historic fabric. The principal elements of the physical surrounds and experience of the castle (its 'setting') which are considered to contribute to its heritage significance comprise:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The relationship between the individual heritage assets which as a group form the complex of designated heritage assets at Belvoir;</li> <li>• The prominent position on an area of high ground overlooking the Vale of Belvoir;</li> <li>• Views towards the Castle which allow for an appreciation of its role as a strategically placed defensive stronghold, and later as a demonstration of wealth;</li> <li>• Views north-eastwards from the Castle over its park and estate land over the Vale of Belvoir;</li> <li>• Associative and functional relationships with some elements of the wider Belvoir Estate.</li> </ul> <p>3.5.1 The Application Site forms part of the Belvoir estate and thereby has an economic, social, and historic connection with castle. The site also allows for the Castle to be viewed from it, but the site is not discernible in views from the castle, other than from its roof. The site might thereby be considered to offer some contribution to the significance of the castle, but the site does not provide the only vantage point to experience or view the castle and as such the contribution the site makes to its significance is low.</p>	Not significant
Church of St Mary Bottesford	<p>3.5.26 The Grade I Listing of the church highlights that it is a heritage asset of the highest significance as defined by the NPPF and is thereby a receptor of <b>high value</b>. The heritage significance of this Listed Building is principally embodied in its historic interest which has been a spiritual and communal centre for the community since the 13th century and its association with the Earls and Dukes of Rutland. The building also has architectural interest as a medieval church with later additions, alterations and restorations and artistic interest through the extensive monuments, memorials and artwork internally.</p>	Not significant

	<p>3.5.27 The church is very much associated with the both the settlement of Bottesford and Belvoir Castle, but it is at close proximity and internally that it is best appreciated and experienced, although its spire is visible from greater distances, including the site and from Belvoir Castle.</p> <p>3.5.28 The setting of the church also contributes to the significance of the asset, although the significance derived from the setting is less than that from its historic fabric. The principal elements of the physical surrounds and experience of the church (its ‘setting’) which are considered to contribute to its heritage significance comprise:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Its churchyard and associated headstones;</li> <li>• The Grade II Listed Parker Memorial and War Memorial and Table Tombs in the Graveyard;</li> <li>• The surrounding village settlement of Bottesford;</li> <li>• Surrounding roads and footpaths from where the church can be seen; and</li> <li>• Belvoir Castle due to its historical patronage and final resting place for several members of the family.</li> </ul>	
<p>Church of St John the Baptist Muston</p>	<p>3.5.36 The Grade II* Listing of the church highlights that it is a heritage asset of the highest significance as defined by the NPPF and is thereby a receptor of <b>high value</b>. The heritage significance of this Listed Building is principally embodied in its historic interest which has been a spiritual and communal centre for the community since the 13th century and its architectural interest as a 19th-century restored medieval church.</p> <p>3.5.37 The church is very much associated with the settlement of Muston and it is at close proximity to it that it is best appreciated and experienced, although its spire is visible from greater distances, for example from Easthorpe Lane, Castle View Road, Footpath F82 and from the northern boundaries of the Registered Park and Garden at Belvoir Castle. Whilst the spire can be seen, it is not overtly prominent, due to its lesser height and the density of tree screening and the village settlement that surrounds it.</p> <p>3.5.38 The setting of the church also contributes to the significance of the asset, although the significance derived from the setting is less than that from its historic fabric. The principal elements of the physical surrounds and experience of the church (its ‘setting’) which are considered to contribute to its heritage significance comprise:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Its churchyard and associated headstones;</li> <li>• The Grade II Listed War Memorial;</li> </ul>	<p>Not significant</p>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The surrounding village settlement and fields to the south of the A52 and east of Easthorpe Road that affirm its rural character.</li> </ul>	
The Village Cross at Muston (LB)	<p>3.5.50 The Scheduling and the Grade II* Listing of the cross highlights that it is a heritage asset of the highest significance as defined by the NPPF and is thereby a receptor of <b>high value</b>. The heritage significance of this Monument and Listed Building is principally embodied in its historic interest as a structure that yields evidence of past societal functions and events in this location.</p> <p>3.5.51 The setting of the cross also contributes to the significance of the asset, although the significance derived from the setting is less than that from its historic fabric. The principal elements of the physical surrounds and experience of the cross (its ‘setting’) which are considered to contribute to its heritage significance comprise:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The elevated grassed area immediately surrounding the cross.</li> <li>• The roadside from where it can be appreciated and accessed from.</li> <li>• The village which it served.</li> <li>• The open field opposite to the west.</li> </ul>	Not significant
Peacock Farmhouse	<p>3.5.43 The Grade II Listing of the farmhouse highlights that it is a heritage asset of the less than highest significance as defined by the NPPF and is thereby a receptor of <b>medium value</b>. The heritage significance of this Listed Building is principally embodied in its architectural interest an example of a mid-18th-century farmhouse which adopts typical 18th-century form and appearance with a focus on proportion and symmetry but in a vernacular style reflected by the use of materials. Its historic interest is as a farmhouse was part of the Belvoir estate and represents a part of the nation’s agricultural heritage.</p> <p>3.5.44 The setting of the farmhouse also contributes to the significance of the asset, although the significance derived from the setting is less than that from its historic fabric. The principal elements of the physical surrounds and experience of the church (its ‘setting’) which are considered to contribute to its heritage significance comprise:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Its garden curtilage – from where the building can best be appreciated;</li> <li>• Its associated traditional farm buildings;</li> <li>• Some elements of the wider rural landscape, including the fields immediately adjacent to its garden which it has clear intervisibility.</li> </ul>	Not significant

	<p>3.5.45 The Application Site forms part of the Belvoir estate and was farmed by an estate tenant at Peacock Farmhouse, thereby the site has some contribution through an economic, social and historic connection with the farmhouse.</p>	
<p>Registered Park and Garden at Belvoir Castle</p>	<p>3.5.10 The Grade II* Listing of the Park and Garden highlights that it is a heritage asset of the highest significance as defined by the NPPF and is thereby a receptor of <b>high value</b>. The heritage significance of this Park and Garden is principally embodied in its historic interest as a multi-layered designed landscape of great time-depth, having evolved over almost a thousand years. It is one of the latest designs by Lancelot ‘Capability’ Brown and following his death his plans and folio album continued to be used when alterations and improvements were initiated at the Castle and on the estate, altogether shaping the land and views in accordance with the ideals of the landscape park. It is associated with some of the most accomplished landscape and garden designers, architects and engineers from the 18th to the 20th century.</p> <p>3.5.11 The setting of the Park and Garden also contributes to the significance of the asset, although the significance derived from the setting is less than that from its historic fabric. The principal elements of the physical surrounds and experience of the Park and Garden (its ‘setting’) which are considered to contribute to its heritage significance comprise:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The relationship between the individual heritage assets which as a group form the complex of designated heritage assets at Belvoir;</li> <li>• Some elements of the surrounding countryside such as where it provides any designed extension to any view from within the Park and Garden.</li> </ul> <p>3.5.12 The castle and its park and garden is at the centre of a large estate and is associated with the Application Site in economic, social and historic connection terms.</p>	<p>Not significant</p>
<p>The Village Cross at Muston (SM)</p>	<p>See above under Village Cross at Muston (LB)</p>	<p>Not significant</p>

<p>Earthwork remains of the moated grange site at Muston</p>	<p>3.5.56 The Scheduling highlights that it is a heritage asset of the highest significance as defined by the NPPF and is thereby a receptor of <b>high value</b>. The heritage significance of this Monument is principally embodied in its historic interest as a site that represents a medieval monastic community. The monument also has the potential to yield further evidence of medieval society and thereby has archaeological interest also.</p> <p>3.5.57 The setting of the moated grange site also contributes to the significance of the asset, although the significance derived from the setting is less than that from its historic fabric. The principal elements of the physical surrounds and experience of the cross (its ‘setting’) which are considered to contribute to its heritage significance comprise:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The relationship of the moated complex with the wider settlement of Muston.</li> <li>• Some elements of the wider agricultural landscape, particularly fields between the site and Easthorpe Road.</li> <li>• Contemporary medieval structures and sites the wider landscape.</li> </ul>	<p>Not significant</p>
<p>Belvoir Castle conservation area</p>	<p>3.5.73 The heritage significance of the Conservation Area is principally embodied in its architectural interest as a complex of historic buildings, several being Listed, and its historic interest through its association with the Belvoir Estate. The Conservation Area is a receptor of <b>medium value</b>.</p> <p>3.5.74 The setting of the Conservation Area also contributes to the significance of the asset, although the significance derived from the setting is less than that from its historic fabric. The principal elements of the physical surrounds and experience of the Conservation Area (its ‘setting’) which are considered to contribute to its heritage significance comprise:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The relationship between the individual heritage assets which as a group form the complex of designated heritage assets at Belvoir;</li> <li>• Some elements of the surrounding countryside such as where it provides a clearly-visible extension to some views from within the Conservation Area.</li> </ul> <p>3.5.75 The Conservation Area comprises the Grade I Listed castle, part of its Registered Park and Garden, and several associated Listed Buildings and is at the centre of a large estate. Whilst the Application Site is</p>	<p>Not significant</p>



	not in close proximity to the Conservation Area it is associated with it in terms of its economic, social and historic connections.	
A ring ditch, a linear feature of pit-like responses, and up to three sub-rectangular enclosures in the north-western part of the Application Site		Not significant
Evidence of Saxon and medieval activity, most likely limited to unstratified finds such as metalwork and pottery sherds		Not significant
Plough furrows and former field boundaries across the Application Site		Not significant

As identified in planning committee report 31/8/23 (8.3.57 – 8.3.71) MBC’s position on contribution of setting and extent of harm		
<p>General comments:</p>	<p>8.3.68 The application site is a largely undeveloped rural space which helps to provide historic context to the surrounding designated heritage assets. With respect to the Heritage Assets as described above, the application site sits clearly within the collective settings of these assets and the surroundings and landscape in which they are experienced. Thus the site does contribute to their significance.</p> <p>8.3.69 Given there has been little change to the landscape in this area, and that the area has historically formed part of how the assets have historically been seen and experienced over a very broad depth of time - views across the landscape are key to how the settings of these heritage assets are experienced.</p> <p>8.3.70 Predominantly, the heritage assets are experienced most by virtue of their visual prominence on the skyline as well as how they are experienced within the landscape.</p> <p>8.3.71 There is a further important aspect of the history and setting of the Castle and its relationship with St Mary’s Church in Bottesford (which stands slightly to the west of north at a distance of about 6km with a 28.2 metre tower, topped by a 34.8 metre spire). It is the parish church for Belvoir Castle and it is here that monuments to eight of the Earls of Rutland are housed. The special place of St Mary’s is known as the ‘Lady of the Vale’.</p> <p>8.3.75 The significance of the heritage assets are in part due the visual prominence of the spires and Castle within the landscape.</p> <p>8.3.77 The significance and setting of the heritage assets are based on how these sites were historically experienced. The impacts are therefore considered to be greater than set out within the applicant’s EIA given how the landscape contributes to the wider setting of the heritage assets, although it is acknowledged that views of the heritage assets are fairly limited.</p>	<p>8.3.79 It is clear the proposals would result in harm to their significance due to the reasons above. It is considered that the harm identified would be <b>‘less than substantial’</b>.</p>
<p>Belvoir Castle (Grade I listed building)</p>	<p>8.3.58 Belvoir Castle is a large hilltop feudal palace which boasts impressive turrets and battlements, adding interest and intrigue to the skyline, Grade I Listed. The topography of the landscape and siting of the castle on the hilltop is spectacular and enhances the castle’s visual presence and dominance across the landscape. Its prominent and far reaching views have been important throughout history, originally as a strategic defence mechanism. The name Belvoir (‘beautiful view’), dates to Norman times, demonstrating the importance of the outward views across the landscape, even from its first conception.</p>	

	<p>8.3.59 The application site forms part of the Belvoir estate and thereby has an economic, social, and historic connection with castle. The site also allows for the Castle to be viewed from it, but the view of the application site from the castle is limited other than the castle roof where this site is visible. However the roof of the castle is not accessible aside for maintenance purposes. The setting of the application site is higher however within views back towards the Castle, for example from Castle View Road.</p>	
<p>Belvoir Castle Park (Grade II* Registered Park &amp; Garden)</p>	<p>8.3.61 Views towards parts of the higher points of the Park and Garden and the Castle can be had from the application site southwards. The application site is largely screened by trees or at too great a distance from it to be discernible from the Park and Garden.</p>	
<p>Muston moated grange scheduled monument</p>	<p>8.3.62 The Scheduled Monument is principally embodied in its historic interest as a site that represents a medieval monastic community. The monument has potential archaeological interest also.</p> <p>8.3.63 The application site does not afford views of the Scheduled Monument or the ability to experience the Monument and the site cannot be seen from the Monument itself.</p>	
<p>Church of St John the Baptist, Muston (Grade II* listed building)</p>	<p>8.3.64 The church is experienced at its closest proximity however the spire is visible from further afield including all areas surrounding the application site. However, the heritage significance is principally embodied in its historic interest which has been a spiritual and communal centre for community since the 13th century.</p> <p>8.3.65 Whilst the spire does allow the Church to be experienced in the wider landscape, only limited views are experienced from within the application site towards the spire. The application site cannot be seen from the church itself.</p>	
<p>Church of St Mary, Bottesford (Grade I listed building)</p>	<p>8.3.66 The church dates from the 13th century with later alterations. The spire is crocketed and is understood to be the tallest in Leicestershire. The Spire, due to the height and the setting of the Church extends far over the landscape.</p> <p>8.3.67 Given the height of the spire the Church can be experienced in the wider landscape including from some locations within the application site. The site is therefore considered to be most contributing to this heritage asset and especially from views across the application site back towards the spire.</p>	

<p>8.3.88 With respect to other heritage assets apart from those referenced above, of note are the Belvoir Conservation Area; Scheduled Monument and Grade II* Listed Building – The Village Cross at Muston; Easthorpe Conservation Area and Grade II* Church of St Peter at Redmile.</p> <p>8.3.89 There are a number of Grade II Listed Buildings in Muston and Easthorpe as well as the Shifted Medieval Village Earthworks and Moat at Easthorpe Scheduled Monument.</p>	<p>8.3.90 The listed buildings within Muston and Easthorpe are experienced within their enclosed and relatively built-up immediate vicinity.</p>	<p>8.3.92 There is considered to be limited intervisibility with the application site and The Village Cross and Easthorpe Manor scheduled monument and as such the impacts upon these are considered to be less than substantial.</p> <p>8.3.93 Overall, given the significant separation distances and the intervisibility with the application site and the above heritage assets it is considered that the proposal would result in <b>less than substantial harm</b> to these assets</p>