

MELTON LOCAL PLAN EXAMINATION

MATTER 5: OTHER HOUSING ALLOCATIONS

PLANIT-X ON BEHALF OF ASFORDBY PARISH COUNCIL, BELVOIR
ESTATE, MRS GREY, EAR OF RUTLAND AND DR FLEMING'S
HOSPITAL TRUST

5.1 Overall, has the allocation of the sites in Policy C1(A) been based on a clear, robust process of site assessment and informed by sustainability appraisal? In particular:

i) has an appropriate selection of potential sites been assessed?

Asfordby Parish Neighbourhood Plan

1. Planit-X Town and Country Planning Services Ltd has supported Asfordby Parish Council (APC) throughout the preparation of the Asfordby Parish Neighbourhood Plan (APNP).
2. The APNP relates to the Parish of Asfordby and has been prepared by APC who are the Qualified Body. The Plan Area was formally designated by Melton Borough Council (MBC) on 30 January 2013. The APNP covers the period to 2036 and has been prepared following extensive consultation with the local community and others with an interest in the area.
3. The Draft APNP was submitted to MBC in October 2016 for publication. The Draft APNP was sent to an Independent Examiner in February 2017.
4. On 5 June 2017, the Examiner recommend that the APNP be modified to meet the 'Basic Conditions' and then submitted to a referendum. The Examiner was Brian Dodd, who was formerly a Director responsible for all development plan and transport casework at the Planning Inspectorate.
5. The APNP was passed by referendum on 28 September 2017.
6. In October 2017, Jelson Ltd gave notice to MBC of its intention to apply for judicial review regarding the APNP. Pending final disposal of the legal challenge, MBC has agreed to take no further steps to progress the APNP.

Housing Allocations

7. APNP Policy Policy A11 allocates the following sites for housing development:
 - Land between Regency Road, Asfordby and the bypass in accordance with Policy A12 (around 55 dwellings);
 - Whitlock garages, Asfordby in accordance with Policy A13 (around 10 dwellings);
 - Asfordby Storage and Haulage depot, Main Street, Asfordby in accordance with Policy A14 (around 67 dwellings);
 - Land off Crompton Road/Melton Road, Asfordby Hill in accordance with Policy A15 (around 14 dwellings).
8. In addition, provision has been made for the development of up to 100 dwellings as part of the development of the Holwell Business Park in accordance with APNP Policy A27.

9. In preparing the APNP, Asfordby Parish Council (APC) considered and rejected other site options including:
 - Land off Houghton Close/Glebe Road, Asfordby Hill
 - Land off Stanton Road, Asfordby Hill

Melton Local Plan Site Assessments

10. The housing site assessments undertaken by MBC are set out in MBC/HA1a-c with summaries of the assessment results in MBC/HA4a-d. Appendix 1 sets out the relationship between the housing site assessments undertaken by MBC and their treatment by the APNP.

Conclusion

11. There are several sites allocated for housing development by the APNP, that have not been subject to MLP Assessment:
 - Whitlock garages, Asfordby (APNP Policy A13)
 - Asfordby Storage and Haulage depot, Main Street, Asfordby (APNP Policy A14)
 - Land off Crompton Road/Melton Road, Asfordby Hill (APNP Policy A15)
 - Holwell Business Park, Asfordby Hill (APNP Policy A27)
12. This, in large part explains the inconsistencies between the APNP and MLP housing allocations.

ii) has an appropriate methodology been used and has it been applied consistently?

Previously Developed Land

13. The NPPF includes a set of core land-use planning principles that underpin both plan-making and decision-taking (Paragraph 17). These state that planning should, among other things, encourage the effective use of land by reusing land that has been previously developed (brownfield land), provided that it is not of high environmental value.
14. The Housing White Paper 'Fixing our broken housing market' makes it clear that Government wants to make as much use as possible of previously-developed ('brownfield') land for homes— so that this resource is put to productive use, to support the regeneration of cities, towns and villages, to support economic growth and to limit the pressure on the countryside. The Government is already pursuing reforms to make this happen.
15. Going further, the Housing White Paper states that the presumption should be that brownfield land is suitable for housing unless there are clear and specific reasons to the contrary (such as high flood risk). To make this clear, the Government will be amending the National Planning Policy Framework to indicate that great weight should be attached to the value of using suitable brownfield land within settlements for homes.

16. The housing site assessments undertaken by MBC includes a brownfield/greenfield land criterion. However, the weight attached to this criterion is the same as the remaining 22 criteria.

Conclusion

17. The scoring methodology used for the housing site assessments does not reflect the great weight that should be attached to the value of using suitable brownfield land for new homes.

iii) are the reasons for selecting the preferred sites and rejecting the others clear and sufficient? Would any inaccuracies in the assessments significantly undermine the overall conclusions?

Land off Houghton Close, Glebe Road, Asfordby Hill

Land off Stanton Road, Asfordby Hill

18. These two sites have been allocated as sites ASFH1 and ASFH1 respectively in the MLP (FC1). Both sites were considered during the preparation of the APNP and rejected for the following reasons:
 - Impact on heritage assets
 - Within Area of Separation
 - Poor highway access
19. The heritage concerns relating to the development sites are noted in SCG1 but have not been reflected in the site assessment scoring, with both sites scoring positively (++) against the heritage asset criterion.
20. Both sites lie within the proposed Asfordby Hill/Valley and Kirby Bellars Area of Separation, but this has not been reflected in the site assessment scoring.
21. If these two sites had been scored properly and the sites allocated by the APNP given due consideration we are confident that neither ASFH1 nor ASFH1 would be allocated by the MLP.

Station Lane, Old Dalby

22. This site has been rejected as an allocation, but has been considered by the housing site assessments undertaken by MBC under Site Reference MBC/030/17 (Extension to OLD2) (see pages 301-309 MBC/HA1b). The site is recognised as previously developed (see page 307 MBC/HA1b) yet has been scored as a greenfield site (--). A more appropriate score would be ++, a score difference of +4.
23. The scoring for the sites at Old Dalby is summarised below:

SHLAA Ref.	Site address	Capacity (dw)	Total Score	Rank
MBC/009/16	North Lodge Farm, Longcliffe Hill	20	29	1
MBC/046/13	Station Lane, Old Dalby	15	28	3
MBC/171/15	Debdale Hill Field, Old Dalby	23	29	2
MBC/018/16	Longcliffe Hill House, Old Dalby	8	25	6
MBC/182/15	Main Road, Old Dalby	12	27	5
MBC/001/17	South of Station Road	69	24	7
MBC/004/17	Land west of Longcliffe House	26	24	8
MBC/030/17	Extension to OLD2	65	28	4

24. Had Site Reference MBC/030/17 been scored correctly, the site's total score would be 32, elevating it to first in the ranking.

Conclusion

25. Inaccuracies in the scoring assessments have undermined the overall conclusions.
26. Land at Station Lane, Old Dalby (Site Reference MBC/030/17) should be allocated for housing development in the MLP.

Appendix 1: Relationship between MLP and APNP Housing Sites

Site	MLP Settlement Status	MBC SHLAA Ref.	MLP (FC1) Ref:	MLP (FC1) status	APNP status	Notes
Land east of Station Lane & south of Klondyke Way, Asfordby	Service Centre	MBC/148/14, MBC/106/13	ASF1	Allocated (100dw)	Allocated Policy A15 (100dw)	Development commenced
Fields south of Bypass and north of Regency Road, Asfordby	Service Centre	MBC/104/13, MBC/006/13 & MBC/006/15	ASF2	Allocated (60dw)	Allocated Policy A12 (55dw)	Outline planning application for 55dw to be determined
Paddocks west of Saxelby Road & south of Loughborough Road, Asfordby	Service Centre	MBC/108/13	Previously ASF3	Rejected	Rejected	
Land off Houghton Close, Glebe Road, Asfordby Hill	Rural Hub	MBC/112/13	ASFH1	Allocated (40dw)	Rejected	
Land off Stanton Road, Asfordby Hill	Rural Hub	MBC/112/13	ASFH2	Allocated (47dw)	Rejected	

Site	MLP Settlement Status	MBC SHLAA Ref.	MLP (FC1) Ref:	MLP (FC1) status	APNP status	Notes
Land to the south of Welby Road, Asfordby Hill	Rural Hub	MBC/028/17	N/A	Rejected	Not considered	Site lies outside APNP Area
Whitlock garages, Asfordby	Service Centre		N/A	Not considered	Allocated Policy A13 (10dw)	
Asfordby Storage and Haulage depot, Main Street, Asfordby	Service Centre		N/A	Not considered	Allocated Policy A14 (67dw)	
Land off Crompton Road/Melton Road, Asfordby Hill	Rural Hub	MBC/004/13	N/A	Not considered	Allocated Policy A15 (14dw)	Outline planning permission for 14dw permitted
Holwell Business Park, Asfordby Hill	Rural Hub		N/A	Not considered	Allocated Policy A27 (100dw)	Outline planning application pending (Persimmon Homes)
Hoby Road, Asfordby	Service Centre		N/A	Not considered	Rejected	
Field West of Hoby Road, Asfordby	Service Centre	MBC/105/13	N/A		Rejected	
Open land adjoining Saxelby Road,	Service Centre	MBC/107/13	N/A		Rejected	

Site	MLP Settlement Status	MBC SHLAA Ref.	MLP (FC1) Ref:	MLP (FC1) status	APNP status	Notes
north of bypass, Asfordby						
Land to the rear of properties on the north site of Main Road, Asfordby Hill	Rural Hub	MBC/109/13	N/A		Rejected	
Land to the north of North View Close, Asfordby Hill	Rural Hub	MBC/110/13	N/A		Rejected	
West Side, Asfordby Hill	Rural Hub	MBC/111/13	N/A		Rejected	
Land to the east of Welby Road, Asfordby Hill	Rural Hub	MBC/149a&b/14	N/A		Not considered	Site lies outside APNP Area
Brook Crescent, Asfordby Valley	N/A	MBC/167/15	N/A		Rejected	
Land off Melton Road, Asfordby Hill	Rural Hub	MBC/183/15	N/A		Rejected	
Land off Melton Road,	Rural Hub	MBC/184/15	N/A		Rejected	

Site	MLP Settlement Status	MBC SHLAA Ref.	MLP (FC1) Ref:	MLP (FC1) status	APNP status	Notes
Asfordby Hill (2)						
Land off Melton Road, Asfordby Hill (3)	Rural Hub	MBC/185/15	N/A		Rejected	
Land off St Bartholomew's Way, Welby	Rural Settlement	MBC/015/16	N/A		Not considered	